



## **Confirmed Minute**

**Meeting of College Council, Tuesday 16 March 2010, 4.10pm, College Hall**

### **Attended:**

Mr Ian W R Anderson, President	Dr Adrian Brady
Professor Peter Chiodini, Dean, Faculty of Travel Medicine	Mr Marc Bransby-Zachary
Dr Frank Dunn, Vice-President (Medical)	Mr John Breckenridge
Mr David Galloway, Vice-President (Surgical)	Dr Linda de Caestecker
Dr Robin Northcote, Registrar	Mr I Graeme Conn
Mr Paul Rogers, Treasurer	Dr Gordon Cook
Dr Jackie Taylor, Honorary Secretary	Dr Hilary Dobson
	Dr Arthur Dunk
	Mr Andrew D Henry
	Professor Sandra M MacRury
	Dr Morven McElroy
	Ms Jennifer McIlhenny
	Dr Rajan Madhok
	Professor Kenneth Paterson
	Dr Eugene Waclawski
	Dr Asad Zoma




### **In attendance:**

Mrs Carolyn M Capps

## **1) Welcome**

The President welcomed Dr Linda de Caestecker to her first meeting of Council.

The following individuals were welcomed as observers:

-  Mrs Kay Rennie (Acting Head of Education and Professional Development Board)
-  Ms Caryn Nicolson (Head of Membership Services)
-  Miss Michelle Wylie (Head of Finance and Support Services)

The President reminded the meeting that Trustees and Co-optees should behave with professionalism, and again re-iterated that all discussions at Council remain totally confidential.

## **2) Apologies for absence**

Apologies had been received from:

- Mr Derek Fawcett
- Professor Michael Lewis
- Dr Elaine Morrison
- Ms Juliet Murray
- Mr John McGregor
- Dr Ruth McKee
- Mr Michael McKirdy
- Dr Roderick Neilson

- Mr James Watson

3) **Minute of the previous meeting held on 19 January 2010**

Subject to the following amendments, the Minute of the previous meeting held at 19 January 2010 was approved as an accurate record:

- *Agenda item (1) Page 2, Para 3:* "Advisory Co-optees" should be added. The sentence should now read, "The President outlined the new Council meeting arrangements for Trustees and **Advisory Co-optees**. He further reminded the meeting that Trustees and **Advisory Co-optees** should behave with professionalism and probity, and re-iterated that all discussions at Council remain totally confidential".
- *Agenda item (4.1), Para3:* "patents" should be replaced with "**copyright**". The sentence should now read, "Responding to a question regarding copyright, President stated that the MoA would protect against other parties, but not third parties. A new MoA would be prepared via legal advisers for both parties".
- *Agenda item (9.3):* the last paragraph should read:  
"In order to support Mr Anderson in his role as President, Mr Anderson indicated his intent to have an internal review conducted in College, and sought the agreement to proceed with this. President assured Council that this review would be cost minimal and that this Internal Review was being commissioned to support him in his role as President."

4) **Matters arising from the Minutes not covered elsewhere on the agenda**

**(4.1) Medical Visualisation Project**

The President provided the following summary regarding the Medical Visualisation Project:

- o The Investment to date has been £0.5m
- o Further investment of £1.8m is sought over next 3 years
- o No Business Plan has been prepared/found
- o No market research has been undertaken/found
- o Similar projects are being worked on in other places

President reported that these issues are a major concern for the Audit and Remuneration Committee and he asked Council to consider the recommendations from the Audit and Remuneration Committee that the Project be put on hold and re-evaluated.

If College continues to spend at the current rate, 20% of capital income would be lost, and with £0.5m million already having been spent, with nothing to show for it, President felt that this was not a viable option. Furthermore College does not have the funds to support this development in the future. Whilst the President was in agreement to support the future of the project and agreed that College should provide more clinical input, he felt that College could not continue to be sole sponsor. The President reminded Council that as Treasurer, he had voiced his concerns about the vast sums of money required.

The President thereafter sought the views of Council.

The option of third party investors had previously been discussed at both Council and at Management Board. Council was unsure about where such parties could be sourced, as no market appraisal has been undertaken.

Following a meeting with Scottish Enterprise, President reported that Scottish Enterprise was unable to act as a financial partner, but could act as agent and undertake market research on behalf of College.

Council was in agreement that College now “needed to see the fruits of its labour” and further noted that that one clinician has spent a lot of voluntary time working on the project.

Whilst the MVP is an exciting project for College, Council members remain unconvinced that money has been well spent. Following the presentation in November 2009, Council requested that a robust business case be prepared and that market research be undertaken - to date neither has been prepared/carried out, and grave concerns were expressed that three months later, the same questions are being asked. In summary, nothing has progressed, although, the Digital Design Studio is desperate to continue with the project and wants to sign contracts and employ additional staff. To do this, DDS requires £680k over the next twelve months.

Council members have been visiting DDS over last couple of days to see technology first hand with an aim to make an informed decision on it soon, and those members who had not yet visited Lab (1) were encouraged to do so.

Council agreed that a business case must be prepared for commercial gain. The meeting agreed that there are lessons to be learned in all of this, not to mention the genuine concerns regarding affordability.

Following a full discussion the following were agreed:

- 1) College should inform DDS that after a full and frank discussion at Council there is real concern with regards to the amount of money they are looking for College to provide
- 2) College will stop in-putting new investment and maximise what is currently available
- 3) There is no willingness to continue at the rate of £680k for next year
- 4) There was agreement that the project requires commercial advice and marketability

In closing this discussion, President reported that prior to the next meeting of Council, he would have updated position on DDS.

President apologised to Council for the situation in which College had found itself regarding the MVP, however the President indicated that he had only been made aware of the situation over the past two weeks.

#### **(4.2) E.W.T.R**

The President and Mr Galloway met with Sir John Temple and outlined the concerns of College regarding the EWTR. The EWTR would be discussed at the meeting of the Joint Surgical Colleges and the Surgical Forum in April. Feedback would be given at the next meeting of Council in May.

At the January meeting of Council, Dr Dunn reported that the Federation had been keen not to lose sight of the effects the EWTR would have on Consultant staff, and had indicated that a sub-group be established that would hopefully emphasise the need for consultant expansion. This report is still in draft form, however Dr Dunn indicated that he would update Council at its next meeting in May.

Dr Taylor informed Council that comments received in conjunction with the EWTR consultation had been incorporated in College’s response.

#### **(4.3) Audit and Remuneration Committee**

Miss Michelle Wylie, Head of Finance and Support Services, provided the following feedback from the recent meeting of the Audit and Remuneration Committee:

### **Medical Visualisation Project:**

The Audit and Remuneration Committee had discussed the Medical Visualisation Project at length and wished Council to note the following:

- Investment to date of £0.5m
- Further investment of £1.8m over next 3 years
- No Business Plan has been found
- No market research has been found
- Similar projects are being worked on in other places
- The above are sources of concern for the Audit and Remuneration Committee and it recommends to Council that the project be put on hold and re-evaluated.

### **Staff Salary Increase:**

The Audit and Remuneration Committee wished to recommend to Council that staff receive their retrospective bonus for 2009/10 (based on the appraisal system) and that the cost of living increase (COLI) be 0.5%.

The Audit and Remuneration Committee also suggested that if Council wished to discontinue the Performance Related Pay system, staff could be given a higher COLI in April to compensate.

Following a brief discussion, this matter was reverted to the Audit and Remuneration to put figures on it.

#### **(4.4) Faculty of Intensive Care Medicine**

The President had met with Dr Short and confirmed that RCPSG was in support of the Faculty of Intensive Care Medicine. Clarification was necessary with regard to financing this faculty, although the President reported that College would suffer no financial exposure to this new faculty.

#### **5) Items for Discussion**

##### **(5.1) Logbook and E-portfolio development – Heads of Agreement**

Mr Galloway outlined the background history to the logbook and portfolio development.

Following a brief discussion, RCPSG endorsed and supported the programme thus far. This would be on the agenda for the forthcoming meetings of the joint surgical Colleges and the Surgical Forum of Great Britain and Ireland.

##### **(5.2) Faculty of Travel Medicine Journal**

Professor Chiodini provided a brief overview of activities within the Faculty of Travel Medicine.

Council also noted that College had been invited to subscribe to the FTM journal.

#### **6) Finance Report**

Mr Paul Rogers outlined the following issues:

- (i) Income and expenditure account
- (ii) The contribution for educational activities is lower than forecast. This was due to an unrealistic forecast being set. Dr Dunn reported that sponsorship is proving difficult in this current economic climate. Dr Dunn took the opportunity to thank Mrs Kay Rennie and her staff for the work that they do within the Education and Professional Development Board - the President echoed these thanks.
- (iii) Medical Visualisation Cost – this is included in the balance sheet and does not appear in the income and expenditure account. The auditors had approved this treatment last year and will revisit it during this year's audit.

- (iv) In response to a question regarding the cost of the Journal of Faculty of Travel Medicine, the President reported that the costs would be covered by travel medicine subscription fees.

## 7) Board Reports

### For information and discussion of exceptional issues only

#### **(7.1) Education and Professional Development**

Dr Dunn reported on the following activity within the EPDB:

- (i) Two public lectures have been organised for 27 April and 13 May
- (ii) Further lectures:
  - (a) Leadership lecture
  - (b) Autumn Lung Conference (previously cancelled) would hopefully be rescheduled for later in the year.

##### **(7.1.1) Unconfirmed Minute from Trainees Committee, 8.12.09**

Noted.

##### **(7.1.2) Unconfirmed Minute from Trainees Committee, 28.1.10**

Noted.

#### **(7.2) Examinations and Assessment**

**(7.2.1)** There was nothing to report.

President reminded Council that examination venues had been previously discussed. The President reported that he would be meeting with the CEO in the Golden Jubilee to attempt to confirm arrangements regarding continuing to use the Golden Jubilee.

In response to a question, the President reported that the clinical skills centre remains “on the table” for discussion.

#### **(7.3) Membership Services**

##### **(7.3.1) Confirmed Minute from the MSB, 3.12.09**

Noted.

Membership services have identified four areas for development.

##### **(7.3.2) Unconfirmed Minute of the Ethicon Travelling Fellowship, 4.12.09**

Noted.

#### **(7.4) Dental Council**

##### **(7.4.1) Unconfirmed Minute of Dental Council, 18.12.09**

Noted.

##### **(7.4.2) Unconfirmed Minute of Dental Council, 25.1.10**

Noted.

#### **(7.5) Faculty of Travel Medicine**

##### **(7.5.1) Unconfirmed Minute of FTM Meeting, 29.1.10**

Noted.

**(7.6) Management Board**

**(7.6.1) Unconfirmed Minute of MB, 23.2.10**

Noted.

(i) The following amendment requires to be made to agenda item (3.2), "Mr Francis McCrossin was asked to compile a job description for the Chairman of the Audit and Remuneration Committee". The President clarified to Council that the Audit and Remuneration Committee was not looking for another Chairman.

(ii) The vacancy for a surgeon outside Scotland remains open.

**(7.7) Academy of Medical Royal Colleges**

The President provided an update from the recent meeting of the Academy of Medical Colleges which had been held on 25 January 2010.

The President stated that attendance at Academy meetings is now crucial.





Referring to the work being undertaken by the Royal College of Radiologists in revalidation, Dr Dobson highlighted that there does not appear to be any involvement with any of the Colleges regarding revalidation. The meeting agreed that all colleges must speak with one voice.

Dr Taylor encouraged members to visit the GMC website - <http://www.gmc-uk.org/doctors/licensing/5786.asp> regarding revalidation. College would establish a small working group to compile a response to this consultation.

**8) Any other business**

**RESTRICTED BUSINESS**

**9) Date of future meetings**

-  Tuesday 11 May 2010 (Trustees only)
-  Tuesday 13 July 2010 (Trustees and Advisory Co-optees)
-  14 September 2010 (Trustees only)
-  16 November 2010 (Trustees and Advisory Co-optees)